

CHAPTER II

LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter will cover some of the theories that will be used in analysis and to determine research data. The main theories presented here are mainly about translation quality assessment, translation technique, and directive illocutionary act.

B. 1. Theoretical Framework

B. 1. 1. Translation

Translation is simply changing language from one to another. What is not simple is that even the basic process of translation itself involves various levels in linguistic. There are so many linguistic events that make translation happens ranging from phonology or graphology which eventually creates a relationship to outside or the world connected by context. This view is inspired by M. A. K Halliday written by (Catford, 1978). Another definition of translation comes from Newmark stating that translation is transformation of meaning from one language to another based on – though not always – author's intention (Newmark, 1988). From the two theories above, it can be concluded that translation is process of transferring the same meaning as intended by the author to other language.

B. 1. 2. Audio Visual Translation

When it comes to translation, there are two forms of translation especially when it comes to audio visual media. They are dubbing and subtitling. Dubbing is one of the two translations techniques that is used for audio-visual media, and it is supposed to give a impression that the person is speaking Target Language despite lips' movement mismatch. (Mark Shuttleworth, 2014). It is different from narrating, revoicing, and voice over since they don't have actors or persons that speak the language.

Meanwhile subtitling is another method for transferring language into other using mass audio-visual communication such as films and television (Mark Shuttleworth, 2014).

Subtitling and dubbing were considered as ignored subject to discuss because there were many variables affecting the quality of the translation. Thus, making the result inconstant and insignificant for research (Mark Shuttleworth, 2014).

To explain further about audio visual communication, Gottlieb shows that the translation in audio visual media expands to multimedia. This means it is not limited to film or television, but it also covers other technologies such as virtual reality, video discs, and other multimedia activities (Gottlieb, 2001).

In conclusion, audio visual translation happens in the realm of what people hear and see, regardless of the medium. If there is a transfer in language, translation occurs. It is also categorized in two forms either dubbing or subtitling depending

how it is executed. Subtitling is when the translation is in the form of text, while dubbing is in the form of sound.

B. 1. 3. Subtitling

Subtitling is an act of translating words from one language to other in audio-visual media or multimedia. Previously, subtitling is used merely for giving synchronized caption. That means, showing the text from audio visual source at the same time. (Mark Shuttleworth, 2014). Compared to dubbing, subtitling is considerably less expensive because the process is quicker, and it needs lesser resource. There will be no voice actor who needs rehearsal and practice to sync with to dub the audio from. Though it seems more effective way to deliver foreign materials local, it also has some challenges including but not limited to time constrain, space constrain, and discourse shift that happens in the films. (O'connell, 2014).

According to Gottlieb (2001), subtitling can be classified into two categories. They are intralingual subtitling and interlingual subtitling. The main difference between the two is what language is being presented in the audio-visual media.

Interlingual subtitling is subtitling between two languages, and that means there is a transfer between SL to TL. Though it seems like written translation, subtitling is different from regular translation because of constraints and the media. Additionally, Gottlieb (2001) also suggests this transfer is not merely between language because its mode is also change. That is the change between speech

language to writing language. He called interlingual subtitling as diagonal subtitling for that matter.

Another classification of subtitling is called interlingual subtitling. This is when the language does not change from one to other. It is just creating the same synced relationship between the speech and the text. A simpler term for this is transcription or caption. Considering diagonal dimension talked earlier, Gottlieb (2001) also suggests that this type of subtitling as vertical subtitling. Most of the time, this type of translation or transcription is designed for people having difficulties hearing, language learner, and karaoke singers (Gottlieb, 2001).

In addition to those types of subtitling, there is another consideration when it comes to subtitling called amateur subtitling, and it will be explained below.

B. 1. 4. Amateur Subtitle/Fansub

Amateur subtitle emerges because of technological development that happens in audio visual world or multimedia. The progress has made subtitling more accessible to a lot of people worldwide. With only desktop personal computer or even hand phone, it is possible to produce subtitle for various purposes ranging from video clips to even movies. Those translators use free applications they can download to put the translation into video. Combined with internet, amateur subtitle can spread to the corner of the world easily (Bogucki, 2009).

There are several criteria that make certain subtitle belongs to amateur category. According to Munos Sanchez (2006)

1. Various typography based on the subtitler groups.
2. Use colors to differentiate between characters in the films.

3. Numbers of subtitle lines varies
4. Notes at the bottom or top of the screen with subs
5. The position of the subtitle varies
6. Additional karaoke style subtitle for opening and ending songs if its unavailable natively.
7. Credit title of the fansub.

O'Hagan (2003) mentions that this occurrence started around late 1980s. However, it is getting more prominent as the technology more advanced and accessible. One reason behind the existence of this fansub is to make contribution in specific area of interest driven by movie genre, movie community, and to make the movies more accessible to various linguistic communities. Thus, it increases the possibility to watch the subbed films or movies to wider audiences.

After hearing the word amateur, another opposite word usually comes up in mind, and it is professional translator. There should be difference between the two, and there are. According to Bogucki (2009), there are at least 5 stark elements that define amateur subtitles.

8. Inability to identify difficult words that is not commonly used.
9. Unable to understand complete ideas of utterances as they take translational decision from minimal information and context. The sound and pronunciation also play important role in taking this decision.
10. Misinterpreting ellipsis.
11. Misunderstanding single lexemes and longer stretches of connected words.

12. Extreme reliance on context.

Even though the assumed translation or subtitle they create is worse than professionally-made subtitle, fansub is thriving for some reasons. The first is fame. Becoming the first person or team to create subtitle of the newest-released films can bring fame to them. Another reason is to allow illegally copied films to restricted countries/areas to be watched by the community. Lastly, they can put promotional link in the subtitle to promote certain business or instances (Bogucki, 2009).

Despite of how problematic the fansub is, it becomes parts of our live with language. The experience of fansub is not limited to movie or films in English. It is also possible to get the experience from fansub from different language such as Korean and Japanese as well.

B. 1. 5. Translation Techniques

In order to produce such good translation product, Translation technique is often used by a translator as the guidance in translating a text from a source language into a target language. Molina and Albir (2002: 509) describe translation techniques as procedures to analyze and classify how translation equivalence works. They proposed 18 techniques of translation, which are going to be described in the following part of the research.

B. 1. 6. Adaptation Molina and Albir (2002: 509) refer adaptation to a technique that replaces the SL cultural elements with one from the TL that has the same condition and situation. The translator usually has to create a new situation that can make the target readers or audiences familiar with the text. For example:

SL: It's 5 Dollar TL: harganya 14.000 Rupiah "Dollar" is translated into "Rupiah" since Indonesians use Rupiah instead of Dollar as the currency. Furthermore, what can we buy with 14.000 Rupiah in Indonesia is equal to what can we buy with 5 Dollar in America. So in translating the price measurement, it is necessary to adapt according to the prevailing traditions of the target community. 19

1. Amplification/addition Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe amplification as a technique of adding details that are not stated in the source language. The additional mean to help the target audience understand the implicit information by providing an explanation of the source language terms. Octovionus (2018: 12) stated that footnotes are a type of amplification as well. So that we may conclude that the additional information can be written directly or typed in a footnote as. Here the example of translation that used amplification technique. SL: Maybe we could share one. TL: Mungkin kita bisa berbagi sel. "We could share one" is translated into "kita bisa berbagi sel" instead of "kita bisa berbagi satu". The translator conveys detail by adding what is meant by "one" by the speaker to make the message obvious without changing its meaning.
2. Reduction is the opposite of amplification technique. Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe reduction as a technique that suppresses the information item in the target language. In other words, the detail 20

information from SL is eliminated in TL. It occurs when additional elements of the source text are familiar to the target audience. SL: There was a car accident here yesterday TL: Ada kecelakaan di sini kemarin “Car accident” is translated into “kecelakaan”. The translator eliminates the detail of what type of accident is. By mentioning only “kecelakaan”, it’s already familiar for target audience.

3. Borrowing Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe borrowing as a translation technique that takes words or expressions directly from other languages. The translator makes a choice to use the same words in TL as those found in SL. The words or expressions is borrowed purely in TL or naturalized (to suit the spelling rules in the TL). This technique is used when there is no equivalent term in TL. It also allows translators to put text clearly in a specific cultural context through a list of vocabulary used. For example: SL: Saya membuat Batik TL: I make Batik Borrowing technique is used to translate word “Batik”, which was one of Indonesian cloth’s names. The translator only needs to use the same word from the source language into target language. 21
4. Calque Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe calque as a word-for-word translation of a foreign word or phrase. Calque is a special type of borrowing in which a language borrows a word or expression from another language and literally translates each of its elements lexically or structurally. For example: SL: He was appointed vice-president of congress TL: Dia diangkat sebagai wakil presiden kongres This

translation uses calque technique. There is no addition or deletion in that phrase. The translator translates the words literally and lexically. The meaning is transferred fully.

5. Compensation Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe compensation as a technique that inserts SL element of information or stylistic effect elsewhere in TL because it cannot be reflected in the same place as in SL. This allows the translator to transfer stylistic difficulties to other parts of the text. For example: SL: Good morning, Jhon TL: Selamat pagi, kakek. 22 If a grandchild wants to greet his grandfather, he or she may call his or her grandfather by using his name. Meanwhile, it is not acceptable to call grandfather by just his name in Indonesia since it is considered as impolite behavior. Therefore, the sentence is translated into "Selamat pagi, Kakek" instead of translated into "Selamat pagi, Jhon".

6. Description Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe description as a technique that replaces a term or expression with a description of its form or/ and function because the source language doesn't have the equivalent term in the target language. This technique is similar to the amplification technique, but the source text element is omitted. There are data that are translated by descriptive techniques. For Example: SL: I like Panettone. TL: Saya suka Panettone, kue tradisional Italia yang dimakan menjelang pergantian tahun. In the example above, the translator provides a complete description of "Panettone". This is done

because “Panettone” is a typical food that only exists in Italy. It is very clear that there is no equivalent term in the target language. By providing a complete definition, the target audience can understand the word of “Panettone”. 23

7. Established Equivalence Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe established equivalent as a technique that uses a term or expression recognized as an equivalent in the target language. The terms in SL are already common in target language and usually based on dictionary or daily phrase. For example: SL : Thank you, Dylan. I owe everything to you. TL : Terima kasih, Dylan. Aku berutang besar padamu. In the example above, the translator uses established equivalence technique. The word “Thank you” in SL translated into “Terima kasih” in TL. Translator uses expression which is recognized in daily conversation of target language. It is expression which is used for someone to express gratitude.
8. Literal translation Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe literal translation as a technique that translated words or expressions from SL word-for-word. Literal translation occurs when the structural, lexical, even morphological in SL are exactly similar in TL. For example: SL : You can play ball today. TL : Kau bisa bermain bola hari ini. In the example above, translator clearly uses Literal Translation technique as SL has same form and structure as TL. The structure SL and TL is S + auxiliary + V + O + Complement. In SL, the form is S (You) +

auxiliary (can) + verb (play) + object (ball) + complement (today). If it is separated word-for-word and translated into Bahasa Indonesia, it will be (You = kau, can= bisa/ dapat, play= bermain, ball= bola, today= hari ini).

9. Generalization Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe generalization as a technique that is used to translate a word with the word that is already known in the wider community. Usually, the word in the source language refers to a specific section and equal in target language that doesn't exist and refer to the same section. For example: SL: he is here to see the halibut. TL: dia disini untuk melihat ikan itu. In the example above, the translator use generalization technique to translate "Halibut". The term "The Halibut" in SL refers to a classification of fish family. However, the translator generalizes the word into "ikan", which means fish.
10. Particularization This technique is the opposite of generalization. Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe particularization as a technique that uses a more concert term. In some cases, elements in SL are generic and when 25 transferred to TL, they are replaced with more specific terms in order to be accepted by the target audience. SL: Search every inch of the kingdom! TL: Geledah tiap sentimeter kerajaan! In the example above, the translator uses particularization technique to translate the word "inch". "Inch" is measurement unit that can be

converted into other units like yard, centimeter, millimeter, etc. The translator here picks one of the conversions, that is “sentimeter”, in TL.

11. Discursive Creation Molina and Albir (2002:510) describe discursive creation as a technique of translation that is used to build a temporary equivalence, which is totally unpredictable or out of context. This technique is often used in translating the title of film, book or novel.

SL: The Fellowship of the Ring TL: 9 Pembawa Cincin In the example above, the translator translates the title of a movie, “The Fellowship of the Ring” into “9 Pembawa Cincin”. The source text is totally out of context. If the title in SL is translated literally or lexically (based on the dictionary), the translation surely will be different and will not convey the intended meaning. The target text correctly represent about the story of movie.

12. Linguistic Amplification Molina and Albir (2002:510) describe linguistic amplification as the technique that is used to add linguistic elements from source language into target language. This kind of technique is often used interpreting and dubbing. For example: SL: He danced with the ugly thing TL: Dia berdansa dengan gadis jelek itu. In the example above, the translator uses linguistic amplification technique to translate "the ugly thing". He or she adds information in relation to "the ugly thing" by translating it into "gadis jelek itu". In the source text, one may not find the words "gadis" or "girl".

13. Linguistic Compression This technique is the opposite of linguistic amplification technique. Molina and Albir (2002:510) describe linguistic compression as a technique that is used to integrate the elements of linguistic in the target language. SL: Yes, so what? TL: Iya, Lalu? 27 Instead of using the Indonesian "Iya, lalu kenapa?", the translator only uses "Iya, lalu?". He or she reduces the linguistic elements by not translating the word "what".
14. Modulation Molina and Albir (2002: 510) describe modulation as a technique that replaces the point of view, focus or cognitive side of the source language. The term can be lexical or structural. In some cases, it is used when other techniques will produce grammatically correct, but mismatched, nonidiomatic, or awkward text. For example: SL: Hey, you're early again TL: Halo, kau tak terlambat lagi. In the example above, the translator changes the point of view in TL but still has same message or meaning of the utterance spoken in SL. If it is translated into "Halo, Kau datang lebih awal lagi", it has the same meaning or message as "Halo, kau tak terlambat lagi".
15. Substitution Molina and Albir (2002: 511) describe substitution as a technique that is used to change the linguistic elements into paralinguistic elements, like intonation and gesture, or vice versa. 28 SL : Especially when I twirl them like this. TL : Khususnya saat aku begini. The SL above is translated into TL by using substitution technique. The expression "especially when I twirl them like this" is

suppressed into "khususnya saat aku begini". The word "twirl" is translated into "begini". The word "begini" is an expression and gesture of the character who twirl. It is included into substitution as it has paralinguistic element that is gesture.

16. Transposition Molina and Albir (2002: 511) describe transposition as a technique that changes grammatical categories; semantic elements are transferred to grammatically different word groups. This technique is usually used as the language systems of the source language are different from of target language. For example: SL : The cottage is still far away. TL : Pondokan masih sangat jauh. The translator translates "The cottage" into "Pondokan". It can be categorized as transposition. There is unit shift from "the cottage" in the SL to "pondokan" in TL. In SL, the form is noun phrase change into noun. It is clear that "the cottage" is noun phrase and "pondokan" is noun. 29

17. Variation Molina and Albir (2002:511) describe variation as a technique that replaces linguistic or paralinguistic elements which effect the linguistic variation such as the changing of textual tone, style, social and geographical dialect. For example: SL: I hate you! TL: Gue benci loe! "I hate you!" is translated into "Gue benci loe!" instead of "Aku membenci kamu!". Gue and loe have the same meaning with aku and kamu. They are used typically for informal conversation in jakarta, the capital city of Indonesia.

B. 1. 7. Illocutionary Acts

Illocutionary acts refer to the utterances produced by the speaker to the audiences with the intention of directing them explicitly or most of the time, implicitly. J.L. Austin (1962) stated that an illocutionary act is an act for performance that must be explained to others that the act is performed, such as a statement of rights, commitments, or obligations. Furthermore, Searle (1979) classifies illocutionary speech acts into five types. Each of them has a communicative function. The five forms of speech are as follows:

1. Assertive acts

are those kinds of speech act that the speakers state the facts for their audiences according to the belief of the speaker. The examples of assertive act are informing, asserting, asking for information, etc.

2. Directive Act

is a speech act in which the speakers get someone else to do something such as requesting, telling, requiring, or permitting?

3. Commissive act

are those kinds of speech act that the speakers commit themselves to some future actions such as promising, consenting, or refusing.

4. Declarative

is a speech act that changes reality according to the proposition of the declaration.

5. Expressive

is utterance by which speaker express the psychological state of themselves, such as pleasure, pain, likes, dislike, joy, or sorrow.

B. 1. 8. Directive Act

Directive acts have main element of attempt or order by the speaker towards the listener to do something. In terms of this attempt, there is a varying degree of strength to determine whether it is just an attempt or it is an order. Both attempts and order, in this instance, are in the opposite ends of the degree. While attempt is simply an effort with no force implication towards the listener, the order is stronger as it obliges the listener to do something. As Searle (Searle, 1979) mentioned, the illocutionary point of directives consists of attempts by speaker to get the hearer do something.

Additionally, Searle explained that there are several words that indicate directive speech act in action namely: *ask, order, command, request, beg, plead, pray, entreat, and also invite, permit, and advise*. Searle also puts *dare, defy and challenge* from Austin habitives into directive speech act. Question also can belong to this class as long as it has intention to get the hearer do something (Searle, 1979).

To make directive act clearer, there is another perspective presented by Searle to identify directive illocutionary act. Taken from syntactical point of view, Searle (1979) shows that directive as deep structure as follows:

I verb you + you Fut Vol Verb (NP) (Adv).

The surface structure of becomes like this: **I order you to leave**. It is supposed to be **I order you you will leave**. However, there is a deletion in NP (the second you part) because it is repeated.

With those two taxonomy approaches towards directive illocutionary acts, the researcher is going to classify translations that contain illocution asking the main character to do something.

To make directive act more specific, the researcher will further classify the data found into several classes i.e. requestives, questions, requirements, and prohibitive. This classification is based on Keith Allan (Allan, 2014), and it is more diverse than classification by Searle which tends more similar. Here's the explanation of each classification.

1. Requestives

The speaker requests the hearer to do something because that person believes that the hearer may be able to do certain things. The speaker hopes that the his or her utterance will be recognized as reason for the hearer to do certain things. The words that usually mark requestives are ask, beg, implore, insist, invite, petition, plead, pray, solicit, summon, tell, urge (Allan, 2014).

2. Questions

Similar to requestives, there is also a degree of belief that the hearer will do certain thing. The difference is that the speaker will ask question instead of directly giving request. The words that usually marks questions are ask, inquire, query, question, quiz (Allan, 2014).

3. Requirements

Requirements have stronger sense than requestives. In Yule or Searle terms, they are equal to command instead of order. This classification is more an obligation than just advice or suggestion. The words that usually mark

requirement are bid, charge, command, demand, dictate, direct, enjoin, instruct, order, prescribe, require.

4. Prohibitive

This is a clear classification among all of them since prohibitive is a form of obligation from speaker to prevent hearer to do certain things. The words that mark prohibitive are enjoin, forbid, prohibit, proscribe, restrict.

Those are all the classification of directive speech act which will be used to identify translated subtitle in the following chapter.

B. 1. 9. Translation Quality Assessment

Translation Quality Assessment, or widely known as TQA, is the means to evaluate the quality of a translation. There are three factors of translation quality assessment that must be considered by translators. According to Nababan (2012:44), a good-quality translation must fulfill three aspects, i.e., acceptability aspect, readability aspect, and accuracy aspect.

1. Acceptability

The term acceptability refers to whether a translation has been conveyed according to principles, norms and culture that applies in target language or not, both at the micro level or at the macro level (Nababan, 2012:44). The concept of acceptability become very important because there are translations that are already accurate in terms of content or message, this translation will be rejected by the target reader if the way opened denies the rules, norms and culture of the target language.

2. Readability

At first the term readability was only associated with reading activity. Then, the term readability is also used in translation field because every translating activity cannot be separated from reading activities

(Nababan, 2012:45). In the context of translation, the term readability is in essence not only covers about the readability of the source language text but also the readability of the target language text. This is in accordance with the nature of each translation process which is indeed always involves both languages at once.

3. Accuracy

The accuracy of the message is an important thing in translation as stated by Mona Baker (1992:57) that accuracy is no doubt an important aim in translation, but it is also important to bear in mind that the use of common target language patterns which are familiar to the reader plays an important role in keeping the communication channel open.

No.	Translation Category	Score	Qualitative parameters
1	Accurate	3	Meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in source language is transferred accurately without any distortion of meaning.
2	Less accurate	2	Most of the word meaning, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence, or text in source language is transferred accurately. However, there is a distortion of meaning or ambiguity or the omission

			of meaning that disrupts the complete message
3	Inaccurate	1	Meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in source language is transferred inaccurately or omitted.

Table B. 1.1 Instruments of Accuracy Assessment based on Nababan, et al (2012)

B. 1. 10. Criteria of the Raters

According to Nababan, et al (2012), in assessing accuracy, the raters should fulfill the criteria below:

1. Being professional translator and having many experiences in translating scientific texts from English to Indonesian
2. Having adequate competences of translation such as linguistic discourse, culture, science, strategic and transferring competence.
3. Having adequate knowledge about declarative, procedure and objective.

In this research, the researcher will only focus on the accuracy to specify and to limit the research. Nababan (2012:44) stated that accuracy deals with the similarity of meaning between source language and target language. Thus, accuracy stands at the top in translation quality assessment.

B. 2. The Legend of Korra

The subtitle that the writer will analyze is from a cartoon entitled *The Legend of Korra*. Before that, the writer would like to briefly explain about the fansub that is used for the data of the research. *AWSubs* have made a big name in

Indonesian fansub translation; they started their translation works in early 2013. As far as the writer observes, *AWSubs* have one of the highest follower in Facebook, with over 200,000 people following their Facebook page. *AWSubs* also translate more than five anime shows every three months. The writer chose *AWSubs* because they are very popular in Indonesian-subtitled *anime* viewer's circle.

The Legend of Korra is a story set after Avatar Aang passed away, where his ideal region has built: The Republic City. In this city, all people from the four nations live together in the same area. At first, the current Avatar, Korra, went to Republic City to train *air bending* in the air temple of Republic City. After that, so many problems happened, and Korra left Republic City for three years. She and her friends, Mako, Bolin, and Asami went separate ways. As Korra left for her journey, problem arises without her knowing. Someone tried to unite the Earth Kingdom with an absolute way (by any means necessary), and this is where the story of *The Legend of Korra: Book 4* that the writer uses the script for research.

B. 3. Relevant Research

There are some previous researches dealing with translation assessment towards fansub.

There was research conducted by Livia Hani Pradytha and Raden Arief Nugroho who discussed about Translation Process Comparison Between Professional and Amateur Translators in Translating Wiji Thukul's Poem "Apa Guna". (Nugroho, 2015) This research shows that amateur's translator even though they do not face aesthetic issue, they encounter problems in terms of speed, quality assessment and word selections to create rhyming poet.

Another closely related research is from Maulidina Sakinah who discussed translation techniques in 1917 movie. She concluded that characters in 1917 movie use expressive illocutionary speech act in different situations for different functions. As the translation technique, the translator is evaluated as having used establish equivalence technique to make the translation equal in Target Language. As the result, the readability of this translation turns as high as 75%.

